Charlotte-Mecklenburg HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION December 9, 2024 Hybrid Meeting Charlotte-Mecklenburg Government Center, Room 266 6:07 p.m. – 8:36 p.m.

Minutes

Present

Robert Barfield/County/HLC Vice Chair Brian Clarke/County/HLC Chair Andrew Dunn/County Andra Eaves/County Nadine Ford/City (remote) Victoria Grey/County/HLC Secretary/Community Outreach Committee Chair John Kincheloe/City (remote) Charlie Miller/City Melanie Reddrick/City Stewart Gray, HL Director John Howard, HL Historic Preservation Manager Tommy Warlick, HL Historic Preservation Specialist Elizabeth Stuart, HL Senior Administrative Support Assistant

Absent

Dontressa Ashford/Mayor/Survey Committee Chair Lesley Carroll/County/HLC Treasurer Emily Makas/Mayor

Note: This meeting was held virtually through the Microsoft Teams video conferencing platform and in person at the Charlotte-Mecklenburg Government Center

1. Adoption of the Consent Agenda

a. Approval of November HLC Minutes

Vice Chair Barfield presented a motion seconded by Commissioner Grey that the Historic Landmarks Commission approve the consent agenda as presented for the approval of the Historic Landmarks Commission's November 4 meeting minutes. The Commission unanimously approved the motion.

2. Chair's Report: Brian Clarke

Chair Clarke thanked Historic Landmarks staff for organizing the Commission's holiday party and Peter and Antonia Wasmer for hosting the party.

3. Public Comment Period

No members of the public registered to speak.

4. Quasi-Judicial Hearings

a. Grinnell/General Fire Extinguisher Company, 1435 West Morehead Street, Charlotte

Owner/Applicant: AP Grinnell Water Works LP Subject Property: Grinnell/General Fire Extinguisher Company Address: 1435 West Morehead Street, Charlotte PIN: 06701207

The Commissioners affirmed that they do not have any known conflicts of interest which would prevent their participation in this hearing, and that they have not engaged in any ex parte communication which would prevent their participation in this hearing.

The following persons were sworn in to give testimony at the hearing: Welch Liles, Stewart Gray, John Howard.

Staff presented the findings of fact.

Staff Report and Comments Grinnell/General Fire Extinguisher Company 1435 West Morehead Street, Charlotte Application for COA HLC426

Project Description

1. Removal of the steel smokestack.

Exhibits presented to and considered by the Commission:

Exhibit A – Context map

Exhibit B – Existing conditions

Based upon the information presented in the application, staff offers the following **suggested findings of fact:**

The HLC has acknowledged the need to alter or add to a historic property to meet continuing or new uses while retaining the property's historic character.

- 1. The proposed project does not meet the HLC Standard 2. Distinctive materials, features, finishes and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.
- 2. The proposed project does not meet the HLC Standard 5. Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be preserved.
- 3. The proposed project does not meet the HLC Standard 9. New additions, alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property.

Staff Recommendation

Staff recommends that the Commission deny the application as presented.

Commissioners' Questions for Staff

Commissioner Dunn asked when this building was designated as a historic landmark and how long it has been owned by the current owner. Staff answered that it was designated in 2002 and has been under its current ownership for approximately one year.

Commissioner Dunn questioned if there is a form that new property owners sign acknowledging their understanding of the upkeep of a historic property. Commissioner Miller stated that this would typically be performed during a title search phase.

Commissioner Reddrick asked if the smokestack is original. Historic Preservation Manager Howard stated that it is original and was used during the original operation.

Applicant Comments

Welch Liles, property representative, explained that the owners are requesting to proceed with the removal of the smokestack. He stated that the previously submitted engineer's report recommends the removal and explained that they have received a second opinion on its deterioration. He stated that it would be cost prohibitive to attempt to restore the smokestack and noted that he has reached out to many contractors regarding this restoration and has not found anyone willing to work on the stack. He stated that the smokestack is not listed as one of the features contributing to the property's landmark eligibility in the designation report. He stated his concern that the smokestack is rusting and may fail. He stated that the top portion of the smokestack could be memorialized on site as a statue with a commemorative plaque.

Commissioners' Questions for Applicant

Chair Clarke asked Howard to further explain attempts to find someone qualified to work on the smokestack. Howard stated someone who can perform the engineering work is needed. He explained that he asked other preservation professionals if they are familiar with a case such as this and did not find anyone. Liles stated that his group received recommendations from staff of contractors who worked on other properties in the area but no one was able to help.

Vice Chair Barfield asked whether the mentioned memorialization was included in the received proposal. Howard explained that Liles mentioned this at the August meeting but there are no concrete plans. Vice Chair Barfield stated that he is open to the idea but needs more details. Howard stated that the Commission could review this project again with memorial details.

Commissioner Reddrick asked whether the engineer provided guidance for how long the stack could stand in its current state. Liles stated that they had not.

Commissioner Dunn asked how the condition of the stack has changed since the current owners purchased the building and questioned whether any efforts have been made to preserve or repair the stack. Liles answered that the deterioration is apparent and stated that the group can begin monitoring its condition. He reiterated that there have been multiple efforts by professionals to repair the stack in place, which remain unsuccessful.

Gray proposed that staff work with Liles over the next month to find a pipe inspector that will perform a thickness or integrity test. He explained that staff would like to hear from someone who specializes in pipes on the condition of the stack.

Applicant Response

There was no further response from the applicant.

Public Comments

There were no comments from the public in support of or in opposition to this application.

Commissioners' Comments

The Commission discussed how to proceed with this project.

Commissioner Dunn presented a motion that the Historic Landmarks Commission approve the proposed findings of fact as presented by Historic Landmarks staff. Commissioner Eaves seconded the motion.

Once made, there was no more discussion of the motion.

The Commission unanimously approved the motion.

Commissioner Dunn presented a motion that the Historic Landmarks Commission deny the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for the Grinnell/General Fire Extinguisher Company, 1435 West Morehead Street, Charlotte, N.C, and direct staff to work with the applicant on updating the proposal to resubmit. Commissioner Eaves seconded the motion.

Once made, there was no more discussion of the motion.

The Commission approved the motion with the exception of Commissioner Ford who did not vote.

Gray stated that staff will report to the Commission at the January meeting on attempts to find resources to receive more information regarding the viability of the smokestack.

b. Larkwood-Chadbourn Hosiery Mill, 451 Jordan Place, Charlotte

Owner/Applicant: NP Chadbourn LLC Subject Property: Larkwood-Chadbourn Hosiery Mill Address: 451 Jordan Place, Charlotte PIN: 08306707

The Commissioners affirmed that they do not have any known conflicts of interest which would prevent their participation in this hearing, and that they have not engaged in any ex parte communication which would prevent their participation in this hearing.

The following persons were sworn in to give testimony at the hearing: Anthony Bernardo, Stewart Gray, John Howard.

Staff presented the findings of fact.

Staff Report and Comments

Larkwood-Chadbourn Hosiery Mill 451 Jordan Place, Charlotte Application for COA HLC460

Project Description

1. Façade and site alterations.

Exhibits presented to and considered by the Commission:

Exhibit A – Context Map

Exhibit B – Original Façade

Exhibit C – Year 2016 Conditions

Exhibit D – Existing Conditions

Exhibit E – Elevations

Exhibit F – Site Plan

Based upon the information presented in the application, staff offers the following **suggested findings of fact:**

The HLC has acknowledged the need to alter or add to a historic property to meet continuing or new uses while retaining the property's historic character.

- 1. The Larkwood-Chadbourn Mill was significantly altered as shown in Exhibit C. Photos from 2016 show window openings enclosed with brick among other changes. During the redevelopment of the Mill several original window openings were restored, new entrances added, façade alterations and site improvements made prior to designation in August 2021.
- 2. The proposed project meets the applicable HLC Standards 1-7, and 9-10.

Staff Recommendation

Staff recommends that the Commission approve the application as presented, or with conditions.

Commissioners' Questions for Staff

Chair Clarke questioned the use of this building. Howard stated it will be a Pins Mechanical location.

Applicant Comments

Anthony Bernardo stated that his group tried to find a solution for the building that would minimize the effect on the structure.

Commissioners' Questions for Applicant

There were no questions from the Commissioners.

Applicant Response

There was no response from the applicant.

Public Comments

There were no comments from the public in support of or in opposition to this application.

Commissioners' Comments

Commissioner Reddrick stated that this plan replaces elements that have already been replaced in a sensitive manner.

Vice Chair Barfield presented a motion that the Historic Landmarks Commission approve the proposed findings of fact as presented by Historic Landmarks staff. Commissioner Grey seconded the motion.

Once made, there was no more discussion of the motion.

The motion was approved with all in attendance voting in favor.

Commissioner Dunn presented a motion that the Historic Landmarks Commission approve the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for the Larkwood-Chadbourn Hosiery Mill, 451 Jordan Place, Charlotte, N.C. Commissioner Reddrick seconded the motion.

Once made, there was no more discussion of the motion.

The motion was approved with all in attendance voting in favor.

c. Johnston Building, 212 South Tryon Street, Charlotte

Owner/Applicant: 212 Charlotte Fee Owner LLC Subject Property: Johnston Building Address: 212 South Tryon Street, Charlotte PIN: 07301613

The Commissioners affirmed that they do not have any known conflicts of interest which would prevent their participation in this hearing, and that they have not engaged in any ex parte communication which would prevent their participation in this hearing.

The following persons were sworn in to give testimony at the hearing: Jack Paruta, Stewart Gray, John Howard.

Staff presented the findings of fact.

Staff Report and Comments Johnston Building 212 South Tryon Street, Charlotte Application for COA HLC461

Project Description

1. Rooftop addition, minor façade alterations, and exterior canopy/sign for hotel conversion.

Exhibits presented to and considered by the Commission:

Exhibit A – Context Map

Exhibit B – Existing Conditions

Exhibit C – Elevations and Plans

Based upon the information presented in the application, staff offers the following **suggested findings of fact:**

The HLC has acknowledged the need to alter or add to a historic property to meet continuing or new uses while retaining the property's historic character.

- 1. The Johnston Building was developed as an office building. The new use will be a +/-245 room hotel.
- 2. The proposed project meets the applicable HLC Standards 1-7, and 9-10.

Staff Recommendation

Staff recommends that the Commission approve the application as presented, or with conditions.

Commissioners' Questions for Staff

Note: Commissioner Ford left the meeting at 7:22 p.m.

There were no questions from the Commissioners.

Applicant Comments

Jack Paruta, project architect, explained that he worked with the State Historic Preservation Office to make the plans as inconspicuous as possible from street level. He stated that he has worked on similar projects in other cities and is excited to bring new life to this building.

Commissioners' Questions for Applicant

There were no questions from the Commissioners.

Applicant Response

There was no response from the applicant.

Public Comments

There were no comments from the public in support of or in opposition to this application.

Commissioners' Comments

The Commission provided positive feedback regarding this project.

Vice Chair Barfield presented a motion that the Historic Landmarks Commission approve the proposed findings of fact as presented by Historic Landmarks staff. Commissioner Grey seconded the motion.

Once made, there was no more discussion of the motion.

The motion was approved with all in attendance voting in favor.

Commissioner Dunn presented a motion that the Historic Landmarks Commission approve the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for the Johnston Building, 212 South Tryon Street, Charlotte, N.C. Vice Chair Barfield seconded the motion.

Once made, there was no more discussion of the motion.

The motion was approved with all in attendance voting in favor.

5. Property Updates

a. John Douglas House, 7601 Christie Lane, Charlotte

Gray stated that the developer for the Steele Creek Property has decided to relocate the Douglas House without financial assistance from the Commission. He explained that when the house is in place, the stabilization of the building will be considered by the Commission. He stated that it remains unclear whether She Built This City has a need for the house in addition to the former Steele Creek Presbyterian Church. He stated that the Commission would investigate uses for the building if She Built This City is not interested. He stated that Foundry is willing to give the Commission years to find a solution considering the amount of time the remainder of the property will take to develop.

Chair Clarke stated that it would be no earlier than early 2027 to determine a use for the house. He stated that Foundry will need to close with their purchase of this property by February to remain on schedule. He stated that the Commission would consider this item at their January meeting.

b. William Grier House, 8120 Robbie Circle, Charlotte

Gray stated that this house was moved to its current location in 2014. He stated that it was never placed on a permanent foundation. He stated that Charlotte Douglas International Airport (CLT) purchased the property and filed for a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for demolition, which is currently active. He stated that CLT is working with Preservation North Carolina (PNC) to try to find someone interested in moving the house. He asked the Commission to give staff the ability to reissue the COA after PNC's option is either executed or expired before starting the six-month effectiveness of the COA.

Commissioner Dunn presented a motion seconded by Commissioner Eaves that the Historic Landmarks Commission direct Staff to extend the effective date of the Certificate of

Appropriateness for the demolition of the William Grier House, 8120 Robbie Circle, Charlotte, N.C., beyond its six-month window if Preservation North Carolina receives an option to buy the William Grier House, for the COA to remain effective for that whole period, and to also extend the effective date of the COA for an additional six months if the option ends or expires. The Commission unanimously approved the motion.

Chair Clarke stated that the Spratt-Grier Farm is located approximately 300 yards from the William Grier House. He stated that this is not a designated landmark but is a potentially extremely important property. He stated that the property includes an antebellum house, which appears to be in good shape. He stated that a log structure is behind the house and may be a surviving dwelling of enslaved people. He stated that part of the option with PNC is to find a new home for these structures.

c. Hunters Chapel United Methodist Church, 18423 John Connor Road, Cornelius

Gray stated that staff is waiting on the congregation to provide final approval regarding interior designation of this property to proceed with the designation process.

d. Torrence-Lytle School, 302 Holbrooks Road, Huntersville

Gray stated that bids for roof work at the school would open this month. He stated that financial decisions about the cost of the project will likely be made in January.

6. Survey Committee Report: Dontressa Ashford

a. Siloam Presbyterian Church Cemetery, Corner of Morehead Road and Salome Church Road

Historic Preservation Specialist Warlick explained that properties considered for the Study List of Prospective Historic Landmarks are not usually presented directly to the Commission. He noted that the petitioners missed the Survey Committee's September meeting and explained that the November meeting was not held.

Warlick stated that the petitioners are descendants of people who are interred at this site and are interested in exploring ways to protect the property. He stated that the Siloam School is named after this church. He explained that the church burned down in the 1950s and that the congregation dispersed. He stated that the earliest known grave is from 1910 and the most recent grave is from 2020. He stated that this is a unique cemetery where graves are scattered and not in a confined area. He noted the large, wooded lots on either side of the cemetery and explained the development pressure in this area. He stated that he and Howard spoke to Ms. Paula Williams recently to discuss protection options, including the cemetery registry program, preservation easements, and landmark designation. He stated that the presbytery seems open to a preservation easement.

Paula Williams stated that her great, great grandparents are buried in this cemetery. She noted that most families were clustered together and explained that some graves are scattered and that several are unmarked, including some that may be buried outside of the fence.

Warlick stated that Ms. Williams' ancestor was one of the rare sharecroppers to make money and purchase land. He stated that there is a lot of information staff will need to research.

Commissioner Eaves presented a motion seconded by Commissioner Grey that the Historic Landmarks Commission place the Siloam Presbyterian Church Cemetery, Corner of Morehead Road and Salome Church Road, Charlotte, N.C., on the Study List of Prospective Historic Landmarks. The Commission unanimously approved the motion.

7. Community Outreach Committee Report: Victoria Grey

Commissioner Grey stated that the Community Outreach Committee will meet on Wednesday, December 18 to discuss events for the upcoming year.

8. The HLC will meet in closed session to discuss a legal issue.

Vice Chair Barfield presented a motion seconded by Commissioner Grey that the Historic Landmarks Commission convene in closed session. The Commission unanimously approved the motion.

Vice Chair Barfield presented a motion seconded by Commissioner Grey that the Historic Landmarks Commission reconvene in open session. The Commission unanimously approved the motion.

Note: Commissioner Eaves left the meeting at 8:22 p.m.

9. Financial Report: Stewart Gray

Gray stated that the only change is the closing on the Cornelius Agricultural Building. He stated that there is \$5.2 million in the revolving fund. He stated that the Commission needs to keep in mind the \$500,000 to help purchase and finance the Edgewood Farm project and that bids are coming in for roof work at Torrence-Lytle School, which could cost hundreds of thousands of dollars.

10. Historic Landmarks Staff Report

a. Cornelius Agricultural Building

Gray stated that the closing on this building has occurred. He stated that it was sold to a nonprofit for \$180,000 and that the 5-year repayment plan will start when the museum becomes active. He stated that there is an easement on the property, prohibiting its demolition.

b. Designation Updates

Warlick stated that the Brattain House, the Marsh House, and the Caldwell-Bradford School were recently designated as historic landmarks. He stated that Gray will present the Armour Street Mill House to the Davidson Town Board tomorrow for landmark designation consideration.

c. Franks House Marker Unveiling

Gray stated that this event has been postponed due to flooding at the United House of Prayer on Mint Street, which is where the marker will be placed. He stated that the tentative unveiling date is February 1.

d. SHPO Training – November 14

Gray stated that staff attended training in Raleigh, which was a good networking event.

e. Social Media Update

Senior Administrative Support Assistant Stuart stated that the Commission's Facebook page recently won the brag board award at Mecklenburg County's Social Media Summit. She stated that this page continues to perform well.

11. Old Business

There was no old business.

12. New Business

There was no new business.

The meeting adjourned at 8:36 p.m.