

**Charlotte-Mecklenburg
HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION
April 8, 2024
Hybrid Meeting
Charlotte-Mecklenburg Government Center, Room 266
6:03 p.m. – 9:06 p.m.**

Draft Minutes

Present

Dontressa Ashford/Mayor
Robert Barfield/County
Lesley Carroll/County/HLC Treasurer/Survey Committee Chair
Brian Clarke/County/HLC Chair
Andra Eaves/County
Nadine Ford/City
Victoria Grey/County/HLC Secretary
John Kincheloe/City
Edwin Wilson/City/Projects Committee Chair
Stewart Gray, HL Director
John Howard, HL Historic Preservation Manager
Tommy Warlick, HL Historic Preservation Specialist
Elizabeth Stuart, HL Senior Administrative Support Assistant

Absent

Akadius Berry/County
Emily Makas/Mayor
Charlie Miller/City

Note: This meeting was held virtually through the Microsoft Teams video conferencing platform and in-person at the Charlotte-Mecklenburg Government Center.

1. Adoption of the Consent Agenda

a. Approval of March HLC Minutes

Commissioner Barfield presented a motion seconded by Commissioner Ford that the Historic Landmarks Commission approve the consent agenda as presented for the approval of the Historic Landmarks Commission's March 11 meeting minutes. The Commission unanimously approved the motion.

2. Closed Session With Counsel

Commissioner Wilson presented a motion seconded by Commissioner Eaves that the Historic Landmarks Commission convene in closed session. The Commission unanimously approved the motion.

Commissioner Barfield presented a motion seconded by Commissioner Ford that the Historic Landmarks Commission reconvene in open session. The Commission unanimously approved the motion.

3. Chair's Report: Brian Clarke

Chair Clarke did not have a report.

4. Public Comment Period

Michael Hoppa encouraged the Commission to expand their social media usage for a better public presence. He encouraged the Commission to adopt the amendments to the Rules of Procedure up for discussion later in the meeting. He thanked the Commission for their efforts in preserving the Akers House, the Grier House, and the Steele Creek Manse.

5. Update on Steele Creek Presbyterian Church and the Douglas House, 7407 Steele Creek Road, Charlotte

Chair Clarke stated that Foundry's most recent proposal for the land is to redevelop the site and preserve the church sanctuary and the Douglas House.

Bill Simerville, a representative from Foundry who is leading this preservation project, explained that Foundry has discussed making the church sanctuary the headquarters for She Built This City. He explained that the preserved area will encompass 14.25 acres between the cemetery, the church sanctuary, and the relocated John Douglas House. He stated that the intent is for She Built This City to eventually own the 4.25 acres that includes the church sanctuary and potentially the Douglas House. He asked if the Commission would consider temporarily owning the 4.25 acres and historic structures to give She Built This City time to own the property. He stated that the Commission would be better suited to find an appropriate owner for the land and historic structures if the need arises.

Jenae Valentine, a representative of She Built This City, explained that the organization is interested in using the church sanctuary as their headquarters and noted that the Douglas House could be a potential additional opportunity.

Chair Clarke asked to clarify that Foundry is asking the Commission to hold preservation easements on the church sanctuary and the Douglas House as part of the mitigation. Simerville answered yes and explained that this was in the agreement to preserve the sanctuary as part of being awarded the project from Charlotte Douglas International Airport.

Gray stated that the details will continue to be worked out as the project proceeds.

Commissioner Wilson presented a motion seconded by Commissioner Grey that the Historic Landmarks Commission empower Historic Landmarks staff and the Historic Landmarks Commission Chair to work with the eventual purchaser of Steele Creek Presbyterian Church and the Douglas House, 7407 Steele Creek Road, Charlotte, N.C., to coordinate details for the presented proposal of the approximately 14 acres. The Commission unanimously approved the motion.

Gray asked Valentine if She Built This City was solely interested in the church sanctuary or if the property would become the organization's campus.

Valentine stated that the organization was originally interested in the church sanctuary before realizing the option of also owning the Douglas House. She stated that the organization is open and willing to put resources behind discovering uses for the property.

6. Public Hearings

a. Parkwood Avenue Associate Reformed Presbyterian Church, 1017 Parkwood Avenue, Charlotte

Chair Clarke asked if any members of the public would like to speak on this property. There were no comments.

b. Thompson-Anderson House, 858 Concord Road, Davidson

Chair Clarke asked if any members of the public would like to speak on this property. There were no comments.

c. Amendment to the Historic Landmarks Commission's Rules of Procedure

Chair Clarke stated that Historic Landmarks staff advertised on April 2 that the Commission would be holding a public hearing on proposed amendments to the Commission's Rules of Procedure. He stated that the Commission will not be voting on the proposed amendments tonight. He stated that the Commission will consider comments from tonight's public hearing and noted that written comments will be accepted until the May 13 meeting. He stated that the Commission will vote on this issue at the May meeting.

Chair Clarke stated that there are four landmarks that have Certificates of Appropriateness (COAs) issued for demolitions, which are currently in their statutory delay period. He explained that any amendments adopted in May will not apply to these properties.

John Floyd, attorney representing the owners of the Midwood School and the John Douglas House, stated that he previously provided a legal memo to Chair Clarke. He asked that the policy state clearly that it will not affect the four properties that have been issued current COAs for demolition. Chair Clarke stated that he would circulate Floyd's legal memo via email to the Commissioners.

Alex Ancona, a graduate of UNC Charlotte and an architect working for Pursley Dixon Architecture, thanked Commissioner Emily Makas for her guidance throughout his education and spoke in support of the proposed amendments.

Note: Commissioner Grey left the meeting at 7:33 p.m.

7. Quasi-Judicial Hearings

a. Pineville Commercial Block, 316 North Main Street, Pineville

Chair Clarke stated that the quasi-judicial hearing for the Pineville Commercial Block will be deferred to a future meeting.

b. W.D. Beaty House, 2400 Park Lane, Charlotte

Owner/Applicant: Sarah and William Coble
Subject Property: W.D. Beaty House
Address: 2405 Kendrick Drive, Charlotte
PIN: 05529406

The Commissioners affirmed that they do not have any known conflicts of interest which would prevent their participation in this hearing, and that they have not engaged in any ex parte communication which would prevent their participation in this hearing.

The following persons were sworn in to give testimony at the hearing: Rick Manship, Helena Cathcart, and John Howard.

Staff presented the findings of fact.

Staff Report and Comments
W.D. Beaty House
2405 Kendrick Drive, Charlotte
Application for COA HLC395

Exhibits presented to and considered by the Commission:

Exhibit A – Project Description: New single family house at 2405 Kendrick Drive, revised plans for front and side elevations.

Exhibit B – Map

Exhibit C – Project Plans

Based upon the information presented in the application, staff offers the following **suggested findings of fact:**

The HLC has acknowledged the need to alter or add to a historic property to meet continuing or new uses while retaining the property’s historic character.

1. The proposed construction is on the subdivided parcel of the Beaty House property. The new house is a one story, single family ranch style house similar in character, setting and scale to adjacent original houses from the 1950s.
2. The proposed project meets the HLC Standard 1. A property shall be used for its historic purpose or be placed in a new use that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment.
3. The proposed project meets HLC Standard 2. Distinctive materials, features, finishes and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.

Staff Recommendation

Staff suggests that the Commission approve the application as presented.

Commissioners’ Questions for Staff

There were no questions.

Applicant Comments

Rick Manship stated that he met with Helena Cathcart, neighboring property owner, and feels that the project can proceed while securing privacy for her property. He explained that the final finishes have not yet been chosen and expressed willingness to work with the Commission on final finishes.

Commissioners’ Questions for Applicant

There were no questions.

Applicant Response

There were no additional comments.

Public Comments

Helena Cathcart, neighboring property owner, stated her concern of the proximity of the proposed house to her driveway.

Commissioners' Comments

Chair Clarke asked for more details regarding Cathcart's concerns and the response.

Manship stated that a privacy fence and additional landscaping will be installed and that a surveyor will be hired to mark the property line.

Commissioner Barfield presented a motion that the Historic Landmarks Commission approve the proposed findings of fact as presented by Historic Landmarks staff. Commissioner Carroll seconded the motion.

Once made, there was no more discussion of the motion.

The motion was approved with all in attendance voting in favor.

Commissioner Wilson presented a motion that the Historic Landmarks Commission approve the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for the W.D. Beaty House, 2405 Kendrick Drive, Charlotte, N.C., with the condition that the applicant work with Historic Landmarks staff on final finishes. Commissioner Barfield seconded the motion.

Once made, there was no more discussion of the motion.

The motion was approved with all in attendance voting in favor.

c. Charles and Laura Alexander House, 203 S. Church Street, Huntersville

Owner/Applicant: Bowman Rental Properties LLC
Subject Property: Charles and Laura Alexander House
Address: 203 South Church Street, Huntersville
PIN: 01906105

The Commissioners affirmed that they do not have any known conflicts of interest which would prevent their participation in this hearing, and that they have not engaged in any ex parte communication which would prevent their participation in this hearing.

The following persons were sworn in to give testimony at the hearing: David Malushizky, John Howard, and Stewart Gray.

Staff presented the findings of fact.

Staff Report and Comments
Charles and Laura Alexander House
203 South Church Street, Huntersville
Application for COA HLC399

Exhibits presented to and considered by the Commission:

Exhibit A – Project Description: Exterior and interior renovation of the main house, a new rear addition, a new detached garage, and site improvements. The exterior, interior, and site are designated. The new 1.5 story garage has details complimentary to the main house. Site features include new pavers and driveway in the rear yard.

Exhibit B – Map

Exhibit C – Project Plans

Based upon the information presented in the application, staff offers the following **suggested findings of fact:**

The HLC has acknowledged the need to alter or add to a historic property to meet continuing or new uses while retaining the property's historic character.

- 1.** The proposed project meets the HLC Standard 2 and 5, except for window replacement. Distinctive materials, features, finishes and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved. Distinctive elements such as front porch and details, front door, fireplaces, interior staircase, siding, and other finishes will be retained, repaired, or replaced when necessary. However, windows will be simulated divided light (SDL) and match the original windows in material, size, and muntin/mullion patterns.
- 2.** The proposed project meets the HLC Standard 9. New additions, alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The majority of new work occurs at the rear of the house.
- 3.** The proposed project meets the HLC Standard 10. Alterations, new additions, and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired. The proposed alterations and additions could be removed without compromising the historic character of the property.

Staff Recommendation

Staff suggests that the Commission approve the application as presented.

Commissioners' Questions for Staff

There were no questions.

Applicant Comments

David Malushizky stated that the homeowners intend to maintain as much of the original exterior as possible. He explained that there were several windows that were removed and replaced with smaller windows. He noted that they intend to match the size of the original windows. He stated that none of the elements proposed for demolition are original features to the home.

Commissioners' Questions for Applicant

Commissioner Wilson asked whether the street facing windows are original.

Applicant Response

Malushizky stated that the street facing windows are not original.

Public Comments

There were no public comments.

Commissioners' Comments

Chair Clarke encouraged the applicant to consider restoring the original windows especially on the front façade. Malushizky stated that he is open to that request and will leave the decision to the property owners.

Commissioner Wilson stated that the textural element to the streetside is important.

Commissioner Carroll presented a motion that the Historic Landmarks Commission approve the proposed findings of fact as presented by Historic Landmarks staff. Commissioner Ashford seconded the motion.

Once made, there was no more discussion of the motion.

The motion was approved with all in attendance voting in favor.

Commissioner Barfield presented a motion that the Historic Landmarks Commission approve the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for the Charles and Laura Alexander House, 203 South Church Street, Huntersville, N.C., with the condition that the applicant work with Historic Landmarks staff to preserve the windows, particularly on the front façade, as much as possible. Commissioner Carroll seconded the motion.

Once made, there was no more discussion of the motion.

The motion was approved with all in attendance voting in favor.

8. Survey Committee Report: Victoria Grey

a. Consideration of Designation Reports

i. John Phillips Little Jr. House, 1136 Queens Road, Charlotte

Historic Preservation Specialist Warlick stated that the last Survey Committee meeting did not have a quorum. He reviewed the designation report for this property.

Note: Commissioner Eaves left the meeting at 8:32 p.m.

Commissioner Carroll presented a motion seconded by Commissioner Ford that the Historic Landmarks Commission process the John Phillips Little Jr. House, 1136 Queens Road, Charlotte, N.C., for historic landmark designation, including the interior and exterior of the main house, the exterior of the servant's quarters/guest house, and the land associated with the tax parcel. The Commission unanimously approved the motion.

ii. Alexander-Howell House, 250 Cherokee Road, Charlotte

Warlick reviewed the designation report for this property.

Commissioner Barfield presented a motion seconded by Commissioner Carroll that the Historic Landmarks Commission process the Alexander-Howell House, 250 Cherokee Road, Charlotte, N.C., for historic landmark designation, including the exterior and interior of the house, including the specified architectural elements as detailed in the designation report, and the land associated with the tax parcel. The Commission unanimously approved the motion.

b. Consideration of Placement on the Study List of Prospective Historic Landmarks

i. Marsh House, 1642 Hertford Road, Charlotte

Warlick provided the history of this house. He stated that the property owners have a consultant ready to produce the designation report. He explained that staff does not typically encourage the production of a designation report until a property is placed on the Study List. He stated that staff is seeking an affirmative indication from the Commission for the property owners to proceed since delaying the issue until the next Survey Committee meeting may make designation unattainable for this calendar year.

Commissioner Wilson presented a motion seconded by Commissioner Carroll that the Historic Landmarks Commission place the Marsh House, 1642 Hertford Road, Charlotte, N.C., on the Study List of Prospective Historic Landmarks. The Commission unanimously approved the motion.

Note: The following two items were not discussed at this meeting.

ii. Charlotte Junior League Baby Home, 1925 Bay Street, Charlotte

iii. Davenport-Rogers House, 9416 Walkers Ferry Road, Charlotte

9. Property Updates: Brian Clarke

a. J.J. Akers House, 6501 Sardis Road, Charlotte

Gray stated that the Akers House is under contract with a buyer who is interested in preserving the house.

b. Steele Creek Manse, 7728 Steele Creek Road, Charlotte

Gray stated that the City of Charlotte has not scheduled the consideration of the resolution for the Manse.

c. Smith-Richter House, 1030 Huntington Park Drive, Charlotte

Commissioner Wilson reminded the Commission that they approved an offer to purchase approximately 2.5 acres of land, including the historic house. He stated that it is now appropriate to act on this motion since the revolving fund has been reconciled.

d. Cornelius High School Agriculture Building, 21126 Catawba Avenue, Cornelius

Gray stated that the Town of Cornelius is interested in working with a nonprofit to rehabilitate the Cornelius High School Agriculture Building as a historical and educational community center. He stated that this issue will be brought to the Executive Committee to discuss using the revolving fund to support this effort.

Commissioner Ford expressed concern about the potential community response of using the revolving fund for this issue while the Commission continues their efforts to preserve the Torrence-Lytle School. Gray stated that the revolving fund should be used to help preserve a building in need.

Commissioner Wilson asked staff to create a flow chart with steps.

Chair Clarke asked if the Commission would be approving further funds for the stabilization of the Torrence-Lytle School. Gray stated that Mecklenburg County's Asset and Facility Management (AFM) department is working on plans and bid documents for the work at the school. He stated that staff will inform the Commission of the budget when it is ready. He explained that staff has urged AFM to act as quickly as possible. He stated that staff will attend a Pottstown community meeting on April 27 and urged Commissioners to attend.

10. Financial Report: Stewart Gray

Gray stated that there have been no significant changes to the revolving fund since the last meeting.

11. Historic Landmarks Staff Report

Gray stated that the Mecklenburg Historical Association president, who is an ex-officio member of the Commission, might attend the next meeting.

a. Parkwood Avenue ARP Church, 1017 Parkwood Avenue, Charlotte

Charlotte City Council's public hearing for this property is scheduled for April 22.

b. Thompson-Anderson House, 858 Concord Road, Davidson

The Town of Davidson's public hearing for this property is scheduled for April 23.

c. This is Meck 250 Kickoff Festival: April 20, Independence Park

Senior Administrative Support Assistant stated that, due to time, she would email the Commissioners information on the remaining items in the Staff Report.

d. Adventure Club Four Wards of Charlotte History Bike Tour: May 18

e. Preservation North Carolina 2024 Conference: October 16, Rocky Mount & Tarboro

f. Donovan Rypkema Lecture: October 24, The Dubois Center at UNC Charlotte Center City

12. Old Business

There was no old business.

13. New Business

There was no new business.

The meeting ended at 9:06 p.m.

Note: The following comments were left in the Microsoft Teams chat:

Michael Hoppa (External)

Yesterday 6:07 PM

Is anyone else's audio choppy? Popping sounds Can the HLC take a look during the closed session?

Alex Ancona (External)

Yesterday 6:51 PM

I had emailed earlier to speak and recieved a response.

is there no further opportunity to speak?

Warlick, Tommy

Yesterday 6:52 PM

Alex: We have you scheduled to speak during the public hearing on the rules of procedure

Alex Ancona (External)

Yesterday 6:52 PM
okay, great! Thank you!

Neighbor (Guest)
Yesterday 7:38 PM
Is it just me or is the audio popping/ crunching when Grey Stewart is talking?

Michael Hoppa (External)
Yesterday 7:39 PM
I noted the same issue at the beginning of the meeting... it must be their microphone

Michael Hoppa (External)
Yesterday 7:42 PM
We're not seeing the screen

Neighbor (Guest)
Yesterday 7:46 PM
The HLC's audio really need a little work...