Charlotte-Mecklenburg HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION August 8, 2022 Virtual Meeting 6:07 p.m. – 6:53 p.m.

Draft Minutes

Present

Victoria Archibald/County Lesley Carroll/County Brian Clarke/County/HLC Vice Chair/Survey Committee Chair Nadine Ford/City Edwin Wilson/City/HLC Treasurer Jack Thomson, HLC Executive Director Stewart Gray, HLC Historic Resources Program Manager Elizabeth Stuart, HLC Senior Administrative Support Assistant

Absent

Robert Barfield/County/HLC Secretary Akadius Berry/County William Hughes/City/HLC Chair Joshua Shope/City Tommy Warlick, HLC Consulting Preservation Planner

Note: This meeting was held virtually through the Webex video conferencing platform.

Note: Vice Chair Clarke led the meeting in Chair Hughes' absence.

1. Consideration of Minutes

COMMISSIONER WILSON PRESENTED A MOTION SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER FORD THAT THE MINUTES FOR THE JULY 11, 2022, MEETING OF THE HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION BE APPROVED. THE COMMISSION UNANIMOUSLY APPROVED THE MOTION.

2. Chair's Report: William Hughes

Vice Chair Clarke stated that he did not have a report.

3. Public Comment Period (Up to 3 Minutes Per Person)

Vice Chair Clarke stated that the public comment period is an opportunity for members of the public to speak on items that are not already listed on the agenda. He stated that the time limit to speak would be three minutes per speaker and noted that Commissioners would not engage with the public. No members of the public made comments.

4. Consent Agenda

a. John Hunter House, 5607 Sardis Road, Charlotte

COMMISSIONER WILSON PRESENTED A MOTION SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER CARROLL THAT THE HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION APPROVE THE CONSENT AGENDA AS PRESENTED FOR THE JOHN HUNTER HOUSE, 5607 SARDIS ROAD, CHARLOTTE, N.C. THE COMMISSION UNANIMOUSLY APPROVED THE MOTION.

5. Financial Report: Jack Thomson

Executive Director Thomson stated that all expected revenue has been received. He noted that funds will be spent on landscape clearing at Torrence Lytle School.

6. Quasi-Judicial Hearings

a. Victor Shaw House, 2400 Mecklenburg Avenue, Charlotte

HEARING ON CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

Owner/Applicant: Eric and Mary Sheridan Subject Property: Victor Shaw House Property Address: 2416 Mecklenburg Avenue, Charlotte PIN: 09505555

The Commissioners affirmed that they do not have any known conflicts of interest which would prevent their participation in this hearing, and that they have not engaged in any ex parte communication which would prevent their participation in this hearing.

The following persons were sworn in to give testimony at the hearing: Jack Thomson, Stewart Gray, Ben Collins, Eric Sheridan, and Sean Green.

Staff presented the findings of fact.

Staff Report and Comments

Victor Shaw House 2416 Mecklenburg Avenue, Charlotte Application for COA HLC232

Exhibits presented to and considered by the Commission:

Exhibit A – Project description from application

Proposed new house (3661 heated square feet) to the left of the historic Shaw House. The proposed design is in keeping with the architectural language of the neighborhood, allows for viable view corridors of the historic house from the street, and respects the overall height of the historic house by being 18" shorter despite a grade difference of approximately 42" between the two house sites.

Exhibit B – Map

Exhibit C - Project plan

Exhibit D - Images

Based upon the information presented in the application, staff offers the following suggested findings of fact:

1. At their December 2020 meeting, the Commission approved COA HLC067 for the subdivision of the Shaw House property to allow for two new lots fronting on Mecklenburg Ave.

2. Any infill project would change the historic character of the Shaw House, but the HLC approved the development of the two lots facing Mecklenburg Ave. The Commission should judge the design and massing of the proposed new house using the STANDARDS to determine if the design and massing of the new house are compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features of the Shaw House, and to what degree the design and massing of the proposed infill house negatively affects the historic character of the Shaw House.

3. The project meets STANDARD 9 in that the design of the proposed Tudor Style house is compatible with the Colonial Revival Style Shaw House, as the two styles are commonly found side-by-side in Charlotte's early-20th-Century neighborhoods.

4. The project meets STANDARD 9 in that the massing of the proposed infill house is much narrower than the Shaw House, and the height of the infill house is less than the height of the Shaw House.

Staff Recommendation

Staff suggests that the Commission approve the application.

Commissioners' Comments

Commissioner Clarke asked about the status of the large tree in the Shaw House's front yard. Ben Collins stated that the removal of the tree was necessary for the placement of a sidewalk.

The Applicants' Comments

Sean Green, project architect, stated that he intended to respect the historic house with the massing and materials used in the new construction.

Ben Collins stated that his house is adjacent to this property and noted that the house fits with the neighborhood.

Eric Sheridan, property owner, stated that the new house will support the integrity of the historic Shaw House.

No one else spoke in support of or opposition to this application.

Commissioner Wilson presented a motion that the Historic Landmarks Commission approve the proposed findings of fact as presented by HLC staff. Commissioner Ford seconded the motion.

Once made, there was no more discussion of the motion.

The motion was approved with all in attendance voting in favor.

Commissioner Wilson presented a motion that the Historic Landmarks Commission approve the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the Victor Shaw House, 2416 Mecklenburg Avenue, Charlotte, N.C. Commissioner Carroll seconded the motion.

Once made, there was no more discussion of the motion.

The motion was approved with all in attendance voting in favor.

b. Dowd House, 2216 Monument Street, Charlotte

Note: The Certificate of Appropriateness application for the Dowd House was withdrawn and not discussed at this meeting.

7. Survey Committee: Brian Clarke

Vice Chair Clarke stated that the Survey Committee will meet on September 21 and November 30 at 6 pm.

8. HLC Staff Report

a. Upcoming Trainings

i. HLC Training

Executive Director Thomson stated that the Commission received emails from staff outlining two specific training sessions that staff has scheduled for August 30 and September 1. He stated that the sessions will cover the quasi-judicial process and identifying and understanding findings of fact. He noted that the Dowd House discussion in a previous meeting illustrated that not all landmarks are the same and that it would be useful for the Commission to understand how previous decisions were made and how decisions may be made moving forward.

Historic Resources Program Manager Gray encouraged Commissioners to attend one of the training sessions or let staff know if the scheduled dates will not work. He stated that the staff report for the Dowd House was still available on the Commission's website and would be distributed prior to the training sessions.

ii. Kristi Brantley and CLG Training

Executive Director Thomson stated that Kristi Brantley, Certified Local Government (CLG) Coordinator for the State Historic Preservation Office, plans to attend the Commission's September 12 meeting for a brief presentation. He stated that the CLG training deadline is September 30 and asked Commissioners to inform staff if they have completed training. He thanked Commissioner Ford for her participation in two CLG training sessions.

Executive Director Thomson stated that he has a scheduled meeting with the County Attorney to discuss how to conduct meetings moving forward given the expiration of the State of Emergency. He explained that staff does not have the resources to conduct hybrid meetings and noted the increased accessibility virtual meetings allow.

9. Old Business

There was no old business.

10. New Business

Vice Chair Clarke stated that the North Carolina Archaeological Society is planning a dig at the Town Creek Indian Mound State Historic Site in October. He encouraged the Commission to attend.

COMMISSIONER CARROLL PRESENTED A MOTION SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER WILSON THAT THE MEETING OF THE HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION ADJOURN. THE COMMISSION UNANIMOUSLY APPROVED THE MOTION.

The meeting adjourned at 6:53 p.m.