Charlotte-Mecklenburg HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION June 12, 2023

Hybrid Meeting

Charlotte-Mecklenburg Government Center, Room 266 5:40 p.m. – 9:07 p.m.

Minutes

Present

Victoria Archibald/County
Dontressa Ashford/Mayor
Robert Barfield/County/HLC Secretary
Lesley Carroll/County
Andra Eaves/County (remote)
Nadine Ford/City (remote)
Emily Makas/Mayor
Joshua Shope/City
Edwin Wilson/City/HLC Treasurer
Stewart Gray, HLC Historic Preservation Manager
Elizabeth Stuart, HLC Senior Administrative Support Assistant
Tommy Warlick, HLC Consulting Preservation Planner
Leslie Johnson, Deputy County Manager
Edward Yeager, Senior Deputy County Attorney

Absent

Akadius Berry/County Brian Clarke/County/HLC Vice Chair/Survey Committee Chair William Hughes/City/HLC Chair

Note: This meeting was held virtually through the Microsoft Teams video conferencing platform and in-person at the Charlotte-Mecklenburg Government Center.

1. HLC Closed Session

Commissioner Barfield presented a motion seconded by Commissioner Carroll that the Historic Landmarks Commission convene in closed session. The Commission unanimously approved the motion.

Commissioner Shope presented a motion seconded by Commissioner Barfield that the Historic Landmarks Commission reconvene in open session. The Commission unanimously approved the motion.

- 2. Adoption of the Consent Agenda
- a. Approval of May HLC Minutes

Commissioner Barfield presented a motion seconded by Commissioner Carroll that the Historic Landmarks Commission approve the consent agenda as presented for the approval of the Historic Landmarks Commission's May 8 meeting minutes. The Commission unanimously approved the motion.

3. Chair's Report: Edwin Wilson

Note: Edwin Wilson served as Chair for this meeting in William Hughes' absence.

Chair Wilson stated that the endangered Leeper-Wyatt Store will reportedly be relocated to a parcel near its current location and used as a restaurant space.

4. Public Comment Period (Up to 3 Minutes Per Person)

Agustin Hinojosa expressed concern regarding the current state of the Torrence-Lytle School property.

5. Liz Morrell, Strategic Planning & Historic, Cultural and Community Resources Manager, Mecklenburg County Park and Recreation

Note: This item was moved up on the agenda due to time constraints.

Dr. Liz Morrell spoke on the work that Mecklenburg County Park and Recreation is doing to identify, preserve, and interpret its historic resources.

6. Quasi-Judicial Hearings

a. John Douglas House, 7601 Christie Lane, Charlotte

HEARING ON CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

Owner/Applicant: TCA - CHRISTIE LANE LLC

Subject Property: John Douglas House Address: 7601 Christie Lane, Charlotte

PIN: 14121112

The Commissioners affirmed that they do not have any known conflicts of interest which would prevent their participation in this hearing, and that they have not engaged in any ex parte communication which would prevent their participation in this hearing.

The following persons were sworn in to give testimony at the hearing: Stewart Gray Staff presented the findings of fact.

Staff Report and Comments

John Douglas House 7601 Christie Lane, Charlotte Application for COA HLC282

Exhibits presented to and considered by the Commission:

Exhibit A – Project description

Demolition and removal of main structure and all other improvements.

Exhibit B – Map

Exhibit C - Project Plans

Exhibit D – Site Visit Report

Based upon the information presented in the application, staff offers the following **suggested findings of fact:**

- **A.** The proposed demolition is incongruous to the STANDARDS.
- **B.** The HLC cannot deny a COA for demolition for the Douglas House, but it can delay the effective date of the COA for 365 days.
- C. The application for the demolition of the Douglas House was filed February 10, 2023.
- **D.** The HLC must act on a COA application within 180 days of its filing. [NCGS 160D-9-47 (d)] and if the HLC fails to issue a COA before August 9, 2023, for the demolition for the Douglas House, the owners will be able to proceed without a COA.
- **E.** The last regular meeting of the HLC before the 180 day period is over is July 10th, and however unlikely, the HLC may not have a quorum at their July 10, 2023, regular meeting.
- **F.** HLC Staff has visited the property and has found the principal section of the house to be in relatively good condition. The siding, exterior millwork (doors and windows) generally appear intact and sound. Inside the house, the floors, walls and ceilings in the principal section of the house are sound. On the rear of the house, a historic ell shows signs of significant settling. A historic hipped-roof porch and a later shed-roof porch have collapsed. The roof may be functioning, but needs to be replaced.
- **G.** Based on the site visit, Staff believes that the principal section of the house is a good candidate for relocation.
- **H.** HLC Staff and CLT Staff have identified a nearby site owned by CLT as a potential location for buildings to be moved to.
- **I.** If plans for moving the Douglas House are submitted, and a COA for the move is approved by the HLC while there is a delayed or active COA for its demolition, the COA for demolition becomes moot.

Staff Recommendation

Staff recommends that the Commission vote to issue the COA, but delay its effective date for 365 days. During that delay Staff can work with the applicant and other parties to develop a feasible plan to relocate the house to a new appropriate setting.

Commissioners' Questions for Staff

Commissioner Shope asked for clarity regarding what is included in the main portion of the house. Historic Preservation Manager Gray answered the principal section is a good candidate to be relocated. Commissioner Shope asked if Gray knew when the ell was added. Gray answered that it looks original and is deteriorated.

The Applicants' Comments

John Floyd, counsel for the applicant, reminded the Commission that at the last meeting where this property was discussed an expert engineer presented testimony that the house is not suitable for relocation. Floyd asked that the Commission take into consideration that the hearing has been delayed for four months since it was filed. He stated that he does not think that 365 days is necessary to determine the feasibility of a plan. He stated that he does not object to delaying the

effectiveness of the Certificate of Appropriateness application for a reasonable period and recommended a delay of 365 days from the date the application was submitted.

Commissioners' Questions for Applicants

Commissioner Shope stated that the report says the house is not a candidate for relocation. Gray stated that he considered this inaccurate. Gray stated that the house retains a high degree of integrity and that it could be different perspectives of what is appropriate to move. Gray stated that the house is a reasonable candidate for relocation.

Commissioner Makas asked whether a 365-day delay would be needed. Gray stated that it has been precedent to delay the effective dates for Certificates of Appropriateness for demolitions for 365 days to give every chance to find a solution. He noted that moving a building is an involved process and that staff would need this entire time to explore the project.

Chair Wilson stated that he was encouraged that there is a prospective relocation site and partner.

Public Comments

There were no public comments.

Commissioner Barfield presented a motion that the Historic Landmarks Commission approve the proposed findings of fact as presented by HLC staff. Commissioner Archibald seconded the motion.

Once made, there was no more discussion of the motion.

The motion was approved with all in attendance voting in favor.

Commissioner Shope presented a motion that the Historic Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for the demolition of the John Douglas House, 7601 Christie Lane, Charlotte, N.C., with the effective date of the COA delayed for 365 days from June 12, 2023, to provide time for the applicant to work with HLC staff to determine an appropriate relocation site for this property. Commissioner Ashford seconded the motion.

Once made, there was no more discussion of the motion.

The motion was approved with all in attendance voting in favor.

b. R. F. Outen Pottery, 430 Jefferson Street, Matthews

HEARING ON CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

Owner/Applicant: Town of Matthews Subject Property: R.F. Outen Pottery Address: 430 Jefferson Street, Matthews

PIN: 22702313

The Commissioners affirmed that they do not have any known conflicts of interest which would prevent their participation in this hearing, and that they have not engaged in any ex parte communication which would prevent their participation in this hearing.

The following persons were sworn in to give testimony at the hearing: Stewart Gray, Corey King Staff presented the findings of fact.

Staff Report and Comments

Outen Pottery 430 Jefferson Street, Matthews Application for COA HLC306

Exhibits presented to and considered by the Commission:

Exhibit A – Project description from the application

This project will stabilize the pottery kiln and workshop on the site, ensuring its structural integrity for years to come. A museum experience will be created for attendees to view from the exterior. Examples of Mr. Outen's pottery and other items will be displayed for viewing. The space around the workshop and kiln will become a passive park with natural surface walking trail, sitting areas and educational signage.

Exhibit B – Map

Exhibit C - Project Plans

Based upon the information presented in the application, staff offers the following **suggested findings of fact:**

- **1.** The HLC has acknowledged the need to alter or add to a historic property to meet continuing or new uses while retaining the property's historic character.
- **2.** The plan to preserve the kiln and the historic front elevation of the workshop are in accord with HLC Standard 2.
- **3.** The proposed new display openings will have some negative impact on the historic character of the property in regard to HLC Standard 2, but those changes are needed to allow for a sustainable and protected display of the history of the property.
- **4.** The project meets HLC Standard 5, as the features, finishes, construction techniques, and craftsmanship that characterize the Outen Pottery will not be significantly affected by this project.
- **5.** The project meets HLC Standard 9 in that the proposed park construction does not impact the historic materials that characterize the property. The features and materials are differentiated and were chosen to harmonize with the historic features of the property.

Staff Recommendation

Staff recommends that the project be approved as shown.

Commissioners' Questions for Staff

There were no questions for staff.

The Applicants' Comments

Corey King, director of the Town of Matthews' Parks, Recreation, Cultural Resources, stated the department was careful in choosing additional amenities to limit the impact on the site. He stated that this site will be a beneficial resource and create a museum experience in the Town of Matthews.

Commissioners' Questions for Applicants

Commissioner Barfield asked if the display that will be installed on the inside of the windows will be constructed so that it can be removed without damaging the property. Gray stated that is correct.

Public Comments

There were no public comments.

Commissioner Barfield presented a motion that the Historic Landmarks Commission approve the proposed findings of fact as presented by HLC staff. Commissioner Makas seconded the motion.

Once made, there was no more discussion of the motion.

The motion was approved with all in attendance voting in favor.

Commissioner Carroll presented a motion that the Historic Landmarks Commission approve the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the R.F. Outen Pottery, 430 Jefferson Street, Matthews, N.C. Commissioner Barfield seconded the motion.

Once made, there was no more discussion of the motion.

The motion was approved with all in attendance voting in favor.

c. Cedar Grove, 8200 Gilead Road, Huntersville

HEARING ON CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

Owner/Applicant: Mecklenburg County

Subject Property: Cedar Grove

Address: 8200 Gilead Road, Huntersville

PIN: 01509104

The Commissioners affirmed that they do not have any known conflicts of interest which would prevent their participation in this hearing, and that they have not engaged in any ex parte communication which would prevent their participation in this hearing.

The following persons were sworn in to give testimony at the hearing: Stewart Gray, Brian Conroy

Staff presented the findings of fact.

Staff Report and Comments

Cedar Grove Property 8200 Gilead Road, Huntersville Application for COA HLC315

Exhibits presented to and considered by the Commission:

Exhibit A – Project description from the application

New Greenway restroom at existing greenway parking lot. Parking lot has previously received

COA.

Exhibit B - Project Plans

Based upon the information presented in the application, staff offers the following **suggested findings of fact:**

- 1. The proposed restroom, adjacent to an existing paved parking lot and 300' from Gilead Rd, should not have a significant negative impact to the historic property in regard to HLC Standard 2. From Gilead Rd the impact of the restroom is reduced by its deep setback. The negative impact on the rest of the historic property is reduced as the restroom is clustered with another incongruous feature, the parking lot.
- **2.** The project meets HLC Standards 9 and 10 as it does not destroy historic materials that characterize the property, and could be removed in the future without damaging any historic features that characterize the property.

Staff Recommendation

Staff suggests that the Commission approve the application as shown.

Commissioners' Questions for Staff

There were no questions for staff.

The Applicants' Comments

Brian Conroy stated that his group used the design of the nearby Hugh Torance House to complement the architecture.

Commissioners' Questions for Applicants

There were no questions for the applicant.

Public Comments

There were no public comments.

Commissioner Shope presented a motion that the Historic Landmarks Commission approve the proposed findings of fact as presented by HLC staff. Commissioner Carroll seconded the motion.

Once made, there was no more discussion of the motion.

The motion was approved with all in attendance voting in favor.

Commissioner Barfield presented a motion that the Historic Landmarks Commission approve the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the Cedar Grove Property, 8200 Gilead Road, Huntersville, N.C. Commissioner Ashford seconded the motion.

Once made, there was no more discussion of the motion.

The motion was approved with all in attendance voting in favor.

d. Siloam School, 10008 John Adams Road, Charlotte

HEARING ON CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

Owner/Applicant: Charlotte Museum of History

Subject Property: Siloam School

Address: 10008 John Adams Road, Charlotte

PIN: 02965105

The Commissioners affirmed that they do not have any known conflicts of interest which would prevent their participation in this hearing, and that they have not engaged in any ex parte communication which would prevent their participation in this hearing.

The following persons were sworn in to give testimony at the hearing: Stewart Gray, Terri White, Samantha Brennan

Staff presented the findings of fact.

Staff Report and Comments

Siloam School 10008 John Adams Rd, Charlotte Application for COA HLC318

Exhibits presented to and considered by the Commission:

Exhibit A – Project description from the application

Proposed work includes the restoration and relocation of the Siloam Schoolhouse to the Charlotte Museum of History. Restoration to the building would include replacing the roof, windows, and any other areas of structural damage. Building will be converted into an exhibit to give museum visitors access to the school's history.

Exhibit B – Map

Exhibit C - Project Plans

Based upon the information presented in the application, staff offers the following **suggested findings of fact:**

- **1.** The HLC has acknowledged the need to relocate a historic property to protect or allow for the preservation of the property.
- **2.** The proposed relocation would move the building to a display location adjacent to a parking lot, and from an original site that has been significantly altered from its historic nature. The move should not significantly negatively affect the current historic character of the Siloam School in regard to HLC Standard 2.
- **3.** The proposed renovation should significantly enhance and preserve the historic character of the Siloam School in regard to HLC Standard 2.
- **4.** The project meets HLC Standards 5 and 6, as the features, finishes, construction techniques, and craftsmanship that characterize the Siloam School will be highlighted, repaired or replicated, and preserved by this project.
- **5.** Adjacent proposed new construction meets HLC Standards 9 and 10, as the features are modest and could be removed in the future without damaging the school building.

Staff Recommendation

Staff recommends that the project be approved as shown.

Commissioners' Questions for Staff

There were no questions for staff.

The Applicants' Comments

Terri White, president of the Charlotte Museum of History, explained that there is ongoing construction near the school's current location.

Commissioners' Questions for Applicants

There were no questions for the applicant.

Public Comments

There were no public comments.

Commissioner Barfield presented a motion that the Historic Landmarks Commission approve the proposed findings of fact as presented by HLC staff with the condition that the typographic errors in the findings be corrected. Commissioner Carroll seconded the motion.

Once made, there was no more discussion of the motion.

The motion was approved with all in attendance voting in favor.

Commissioner Carroll presented a motion that the Historic Landmarks Commission approve the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the Siloam School, 10008 John Adams Road, Charlotte, N.C. Commissioner Ashford seconded the motion.

Once made, there was no more discussion of the motion.

The motion was approved with all in attendance voting in favor.

7. Design Review Workshop for Louise Cotton Mill

Gray stated that this is a conceptual proposal for changes to Louise Cotton Mill. He explained that no Certificate of Appropriateness has been submitted and no motion is needed. He explained that the owners are interested in initial feedback from the Commission. He introduced the ownership group: Jonathan Beall, Hugh Shytle, Walter Parks, and Herb Coleman.

Gray stated that the infill building does not have much impact from Louise Avenue but does have a big impact from Hawthorne Lane.

Walter Parks, architect, explained that they are concerned about context and would like feedback on scale and massing. Chair Wilson asked why the view from Louise Avenue is considered the primary view. Parks stated that that is the historic primary façade detailed in the designation report.

Parks described plans for the building as four levels of apartments over one level of retail with underground parking.

Note: Commissioner Eaves left the meeting at 8:30 p.m.

Commissioner Barfield expressed his discomfort with the massing of the proposed building, particularly on the side closer to the historic mill. He stated that appropriate material choices on that side of the building to lessen the massing may make it feel less imposing. He stated that the building could either complement the historic property or purposely oppose it so that the new building is distinct and clearly not historic.

Gray stated that staff is willing to discuss the design further with the owners and Commissioners Barfield and Shope.

8. Projects Committee Report: Edwin Wilson

Chair Wilson stated that the Projects Committee met on May 23. He stated that the Committee considered an offer to purchase the Torrence-Lytle School. He stated that the Committee does not yet have a recommendation to the full Commission but may discuss it at the Commission's

July 10 meeting. He explained that Mecklenburg County is working with the public to seek further input.

Chair Wilson stated that a full update on the Excelsior Club was provided. He stated that at a meeting attended by Gray, Deputy County Manager Leslie Johnson, and Chair William Hughes it was explained that the building will likely be replicated. Chair Wilson explained that the building was built in phases and does not have structural integrity. He emphasized the importance of the covered awning. He stated that replication is not preferred but may be the only option. Gray stated that the financial agreement mentions the building may be restored or replicated.

Chair Wilson stated that the Committee was updated on a potential cooperation with Charlotte Douglas International Airport to relocate nearby historic properties. He thanked staff for furthering this relationship. Gray stated that he is meeting with an airport staff member at the end of the month to look at a prospective site. He emphasized that there is no commitment, but the two organizations are actively working together.

Chair Wilson stated that the Committee was also updated on Mt. Carmel Baptist Church. He explained that he is recused from this discussion. Gray stated that the Commission will be considering a Certificate of Appropriateness application at the July meeting for a stabilization project for the building.

Commissioner Makas stated it would be helpful for new Commissioners to have a full recap of matters associated with the Torrence-Lytle School. Gray stated that the Commission would need to go into closed session with counsel to discuss the lawsuit. Chair Wilson stated that an underemphasized fact is that the property was under contract to purchase twice by this specific party who did not close. Gray stated that staff could answer questions at a staff level. Chair Wilson stated that another purchaser has come forward with an offer to purchase and that is what was considered by the Projects Committee.

9. Financial Report: Stewart Gray

Gray stated that the County is still working to reconcile the revolving fund.

10. HLC Staff Report

a. Certified Local Government Training Requirements

Gray reported that staff and at least two Commission members need to attend at least one in person training session or view at least three virtual trainings each and submit a brief synopsis. He noted that there is a training in Waxhaw on August 10 and stated staff would provide further information.

Note: Commissioner Ford left the meeting at 8:57 p.m.

b. HLC 50th Anniversary Story Map

Senior Administrative Support Assistant Stuart and Consulting Preservation Planner Warlick showed the story map created by Mecklenburg County's GIS department for the Commission's 50th anniversary.

c. Adventure Club Recap: Plaza Midwood Bike Tour

Gray stated that the Adventure Club and Charlotte Spokes People had a good turnout for the Plaza Midwood Bike Tour on June 3.

11. Old Business

Chair Wilson stated that the Projects Committee discussed the need for the Commission to solicit voluntary donations of protective easements. He stated that discussions regarding this should continue.

12. New Business

There was no new business.

Commissioner Barfield presented a motion seconded by Commissioner Carroll that the meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission adjourn. The Commission unanimously approved the motion.

The meeting adjourned at 9:07 p.m.