

Survey and National Register Branch Supervisor, Sarah David, reviewed the report and offers the following comments:

Thank you for the report for the Butler House in Charlotte in Mecklenburg County. We have reviewed the information in the report and offer the following comments in accordance with North Carolina General Statute.

According to the report, the Butler House is one of the best and most substantial extant examples of the Craftsman bungalow in the Lockwood neighborhood. The proposed boundary encompasses the parcel associated with the house.

Pages 3-4

It is incorrect to assert that the house “retains a good amount of its design integrity,” and it is incorrect to assert that the house “retains a high degree of exterior material integrity.”

These statements are incorrect because the house has undergone changes that have a significant negative impact on the house’s integrity of design and materials. These changes are acknowledged here and in the report’s text, but they are downplayed. The alteration of the porch posts from solid brick columns to battered posts on brick piers is a substantial design alteration that detracts significantly from the house’s original design. The addition of new cedar shingles, in place of original weatherboards, and the addition of additional attic windows in the gable end are also major design and material alterations that have been made to the primary character-defining elevation. These three alterations create a false sense of design and style.

For a successful claim that the Butler House is one of Lockwood’s best Craftsman designs, other comparable examples are needed to support that claim. As it stands, the Craftsman houses pictured on page 7 appear to retain more architectural integrity than the Butler House.

Page 4

The report says the battered posts are set “up” on brick piers; this should be “on.”

Page 8

Generally speaking in North Carolina, the Craftsman style, as applied to modest, worker-class housing, was hitting its stride in the 1920s, not declining in use by 1925. Certainly, Colonial Revival was the style of choice for very large or grander dwellings in the 1920s, but modest houses, such as the Butler House, were very commonly executed with Craftsman references throughout the entire decade of the 1920s.

Page 9

Gentrification and/or the prevention of gentrification may not be in the Commission’s prevue.

Page 34

The text ends abruptly. This is a layout error.

The photo looks more like asbestos siding than wood, but wood siding covers each elevation?

General Comments

Regarding the racial changes in the neighborhood's population, it might be clearer to note that urban renewal in other parts of Charlotte displaced African Americans in the 1960s and 1970s, and that redlining had contributed to Lockwood's decrease in property values so that by the 1960s and 1970s, the neighborhood was affordable for displaced African Americans. The report currently presents that information in reverse order: presenting redlining as a cause before later explaining that the changes were caused by urban renewal many years after redlining. Indeed, the changes in Lockwood were underpinned by redlining, but the report draws a connection with redlining very early in the text without explaining the connection until much later in the report.

With these changes, including a more realistic assessment of the house's architectural integrity, we believe the designation report will provide the preservation commission and local governing board sufficient information to determine whether the Butler House possesses the requisite special local significance and integrity for local historic landmark designation.