**Town of Cornelius**  
**Historic Preservation Commission**  
**Historic Landmark Designation Staff Report**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Date:</strong></th>
<th>August 24, 2009</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Cornelius Case #:</strong></td>
<td>HLD 01-09</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Property Name:</strong></td>
<td>The Hoyle House</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| **Location:** | 11511 Smith Road  
| | Cornelius, Mecklenburg County, NC |
| **Acreage:** | 0.816 acres |
| **Meck. Co. Tax ID:** | 007-511-28 |
| **Property Owner(s):** | Kenneth E. Forster  
| | 11511 Smith Road  
| | Cornelius, NC 28031  
| | (704) 361-1627 |
| **Date of Construction:** | 1918 |
| **Zoning:** | Neighborhood Residential |
| **Public Hearing & Consideration Dates:** | Historic Preservation Commission  
| | Town Board of Commissioners  
| | 8-24-09  
| | 9-21-09 |

**Exhibits**

- **Exhibit A:** Application for Landmark Designation Consideration
- **Exhibit B:** Aerial Photo
- **Exhibit C:** Photo of Property – 1940’s
- **Exhibit D:** Photo of Property – 1970’s
- **Exhibit E:** Current Property Photographs
- **Exhibit F:** Comparable Property Photographs
- **Exhibit G:** Real Estate Lookup with Assessed Tax Value
- **Exhibit H:** Interior Photos
- **Exhibit I:** Photo of Property – March 1, 2009
**Location, Boundaries, and Justification of Proposed Designation**

The subject property, which was once part of the Nationally Designated Potts Plantation, is located southeast of Cornelius Town Hall on the east side of the Norfolk Southern Railroad tracks. The property is surrounded on all sides by Potts Plantation property. The entire property, comprised of 0.816 acres and including the primary structure, is included in the proposed designation.

The house and property are unique due to the condition, under which it was built, as well as its style and current condition. See Exhibits B, C, D and E for photographs of the property over the years.

**Historic Background and Significance Assessment**

Reverend Enoch Marvin Hoyle, Sr. became the Pastor of Mount Zion United Methodist Church in December, 1915.¹ As the Pastor of Mount Zion, Reverend Hoyle², his wife Olive Leola Turner Hoyle and their five children lived in the Mount Zion Church Parsonage located at 19631 South Main Street. Designated on December 20, 2004, the Mount Zion Methodist Church Parsonage was the first landmark designated in the Town of Cornelius.

A graduate of Trinity College, Reverend Hoyle served as pastor in Durham, Greenville, Lumberton and Asheville before arriving in Cornelius.³ According to long time Cornelius residents, he was well liked and respected by everyone.

Reverend Hoyle died on July 3, 1917 at the young age of 37 in Statesville, NC.⁴ As testament to his popularity, several well-known members of the Mount Zion community, including Mr. R.J. Stough of the Stough-Cornelius Mill, traveled to Statesville upon learning of Reverend Hoyle’s passing⁵, although the burial would take place at Mount Zion. Bishop John C. Kilgo gave the sermon and eulogy.

The widow Hoyle and her five children had to move out of the parsonage, where the new Mount Zion Church pastor would reside. According to the Mecklenburg County Register of Deeds, W.R. Potts and his wife Kate W. Potts sold the subject property to Olive Hoyle and her father-in-law, J.M. Hoyle on May 5, 1918. The Hoyle House was built just east of Mt. Zion Church to accommodate the Hoyle family – the widow Hoyle, daughter Ruth and four sons Jonathan V. Hoyle, E. Marvin Hoyle, Jr., Robert T. Hoyle and David W. Hoyle.⁶

J.M. Hoyle later sold the property to his granddaughter, Ruth, who married Davidson College student William A. Cathey on November 28, 1928. Ms. Cathey taught third grade at Cornelius Elementary and also taught piano lessons. Mr. Cathey later partnered with his brother-in-law, Robert Hoyle, to open the Cathey-Hoyle Funeral Home and insurance agency in 1947 in Davidson. The funeral home closed in 1972.⁷

In 1942 the Cathey’s sold the property to Clifton Eugene Smith, nephew of William Robert Potts (descendent of original land owner, John Potts). Mr. Smith purchased the property for his daughter Miriam Smith Whisnant and her husband, Louis Rodney Whisnant, to live in following Mr. Whisnant’s return from World War II. Mr. Smith later sold the property to one of Cornelius’ first pharmacists, Hal Sharp.

A former Army Ranger, Mr. Sharp operated Midway Pharmacy in Cornelius for 19 years, was on the Town Board of Commissioners 1961 – 1963, an active member of Bethel Presbyterian Church and a fireman with the Cornelius-Lemley Volunteer Fire Department. The Midway Pharmacy was the only business in the area with fountain Cokes. James Barbee, Mr. Sharp’s son-

---

*Hoyle House Designation Report*

*Page 2 of 5*
in-law is the current Chief of the Cornelius-Lemley Volunteer Fire Department. Mr. Sharp's grandson, Gary Barbee is also a member of the Cornelius-Lemley Volunteer Fire Department.

**Chain of Title**

1. W.R. Potts & wife, Kate W. Potts conveyed 22 acres, more or less, to J.M. Hoyle (father-in-law & Olive Hoyle (daughter-in-law) on May 5, 1918. Book 392, Page 64.

2. J.M. Hoyle (widower) conveyed 22 acres to Wm. A. Cathey and wife Hugh H. Cathey on May 8, 1931. Book 832, Page 129. See also Quit Claim Deed Book 603, Page 41 and dated September 30, 1925.


4. C.E. Smith and wife, Mary B. Smith to Hal D. Sharp and wife, Saye C. Sharp a portion of 22 acres as described in Book 2246, Page 405 dated July 10, 1961.

5. The Estate of Hal Donnalda Sharp and Dorothy Delaney Sharp (widow) to JoAnne Sharp (a single woman) Parcel #007-511-28 on November 6, 2002. Book 14351, Pages 452-457.


9. Gary W. Fortune & wife, Brenda Kay Fortune conveyed 0.956 acres (0.140 acres of which is in the right of way of Smith Road) to Kenneth E. Forster on December 13, 2002. Book 19754, Pages 107-110.

**Physical Description**

The following physical description is taken from the 2004 *Cornelius Historic Survey Update:*

*The Hoyle House is a two and half story Foursquare house, high hip roof with hip dormer, irregular fenestration, interior chimney, aluminum siding.*

The Hoyle house, located approximately ¼ mile east of the Norfolk Southern Railroad tracks and is in a rural area of Town — one of the few remaining rural areas located in Cornelius. Other than the Historical Potts Plantation, houses on Smith Road are typically single story brick houses built in the late 1950’s and early 1960’s. Mount Zion United Methodist Church and its cemetery are also located at the beginning of Smith Road.

The two and one-half story American Foursquare Hoyle house is one of three American Foursquare style houses in Cornelius; however, it is the only American Foursquare style house with wood siding. As typical of the American Foursquare style, the house architecture is simple using handcrafted woodwork. The original footprint contained four large rooms on each of the
two floors, a center front dormer, side dormer and a large front porch with wide stairs. There are five coal burning fireplaces using two brick chimneys.

The interior and exterior of the Hoyle House are in very good physical condition. As only one of three American Foursquare style houses remaining in Cornelius, and the only one with original wood siding, it is one of the more unique and intact houses of its kind in the Town.

**Integrity Evaluation**

The Hoyle house retains much of its structural and architectural integrity and is the best preserved structure of its type and architectural style in the Town of Cornelius, for this time period. The front of the house faces south on what is now known as Smith Road (formerly known as Potts Road).

Exhibit F contains a comparison of two other American Foursquare style houses in Cornelius. Both houses used for comparison, built with brick materials, are on the Cornelius Historic Survey.

The Hoyle house has undergone extensive restoration by the current owner. The house was built upon a red brick foundation and the original footprint of the house is now sheathed in the original wood siding, which was once covered in vinyl siding by a previous owner. The original wood siding has been restored and is in good physical condition.

The two (2) three-over-three windows on the south and west dormers are the original dormer windows. All other exterior windows appear to have been one-over-one windows (see Exhibit C) and have been replaced with modern insulated windows. At the time of renovation, the current owner did not know the south side second story once contained four (4) windows. The wide window casings appear to be original, except for the top molding portions which were widened to accommodate slightly larger windows in some cases and are flush with the window casings.

The original structure included a wide wrap-around porch with wood floors, five wooden square support columns and wide stairs leading to the front yard. The porch was removed by a prior owner and has been restored with the addition of railings to meet current building standards. There were two (2) windows in the east side ell, or recessed portion of the porch, one facing south and one facing east. The window facing south has been converted to another entryway. An additional stairway leads from the east side of the porch into the yard. The porch ceiling is tongue-in-groove one inch wood planks which are painted white. The porch roof material is similar to the current house roof material which is 5-V Crimp Metal roofing.

All exterior doors have been replaced. The simple, front wood door has been replaced with a three-quarter glass and wood door with two sidelights and transom. On the right side of the door is the original single sconce light fixture, which was also on the right side of the original door. The converted entryway on the east side ell, or recessed portion of the porch, has a door of similar style as the main entryway.

A room with a shed roof extends north from the northeast side of the house and appears to be part of the original primary structure based on the wood siding, the photograph in Exhibit C and the similar construction of the Ashley Carol House as seen in Exhibit F. A sunroom, using wood siding and deck have been added to the northwest side of the house.

The bottom portion of both chimneys is original; repair work has been done to the top half of both chimneys with new brick and mortar.
Interior
The front door opens into a wide and long foyer with two large rooms on each side, an additional kitchen on the northwest corner and sunroom at the rear east side of the foyer. All rooms are spacious by today’s standards. Double-sided fireplaces face each of the original four first floor rooms. Moldings are simple and wide throughout the house. The original floors remain in much of the interior of the house.

The room on the west side connects to a second room via an open entryway and contains a window on its eastern wall. This small two-over-two window appears to indicate where the original structure ended on that side of the house and perhaps looked out onto a back stoop. This second room connects to a modern kitchen.

The second room on the east side is accessed via the foyer and has been divided to accommodate an additional bathroom.

The staircase was once ell shaped and has been straightened into a single flight of stairs to the second floor.

The second floor has been converted from four (4) rooms to three (3) rooms. You face the master suite entrance as you reach the top of the stairs, which now encompasses the entire front half (south side) of the second story. One room is located on each side of the stairway on the north side of the house.

Any projects proposed to take place following a local Historic Landmark designation will require review and approval by the Town of Cornelius Historic Preservation Commission or the Planning Director.

Assessed Value of Property
The Mecklenburg County Tax Assessor’s Office assessed the value of the entire property including approximately 0.82 acres of land and all structures and improvements at $202,800 on May 23, 2008. The Town of Cornelius receives $557.70 in ad valorem taxes for the structure and the land. If the entire property is historically designated, Cornelius would receive $278.85 in ad valorem taxes. Mecklenburg County receives $1,700.88 in ad valorem taxes for the property and would receive $850.44 if the entire property were historically designated.

References
1 “Rev. E. Marvin Hoyle, Sr., Died While Pastor of Mount Zion.” Mecklenburg Gazette [Charlotte, NC]. May 19, 1949
2 Photograph of Reverend Hoyle courtesy of Mount Zion United Methodist Church
3 “Rev. E. Marvin Hoyle, Sr., Died While Pastor of Mount Zion.” Mecklenburg Gazette [Charlotte, NC]. May 19, 1949
6 1920 Census
7 “Methodist Church Renovates Chapel and Neighboring Structures.” Davidson Historical Society [Davidson, NC]. Fall 2003
**Application for Landmark Designation Consideration**

### 1. Property Information

- **Date of Application**: 10-17-08
- **Name of Property**: Hoyt House (Hop House?)
- **Location**: 1151 Smith Rd
- **Property Size (acres)**: 1.0
- **Estimated or Actual Year Built**: 1800
- **Current Property Use**: Private Residence
- **Tax Parcel Number(s)**: 0076-1126

**Historical/Cultural/Architectural Significance of Property:**

**Building**  
Built by the preacher  
Mizpah UMC in 1800 sold to the Shope's to get them to be the 1st pharmacist in Cornelius

**Briefly Describe Property:**

- **2 Story Wood Frame - 5 Fireplaces - Front Porch - Back Porch built in 1800**

(Example: One and half story brick bungalow built in 1925, garage in rear yard, stone retaining wall)

### 2. Contact Information

- **Property Owner**: Kenneth E. Forster
- **Address**: 1151 Smith Rd
- **City, State, Zip**: Cornelius, NC 28031
- **Telephone**: 704-361-1627
- **Fax**: Ken Forster @ Charlotte, Twitter.com

### 3. Designation Agreement

I hereby agree to have my property, located within the Sphere of Influence of Cornelius, North Carolina, **considered** for local historic landmark designation. I understand that my property is designated, I must follow the **Cornelius Historic Preservation Guidelines** and the **Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation** and obtain a Certificate of Appropriateness prior to conducting any change to the exterior of my property.

**Signature**: [Signature]

Print Name: Kenneth E. Forster

**Date**: 10-17-08

**Date Received**: [Date]

Received By: [Name]
This map is prepared for the inventory of real property within Mecklenburg County and is compiled from recorded deeds, plats, tax maps, surveys, planimetric maps, and other public records and data. Users of this map are hereby notified that the aforementioned public primary information sources should be consulted for verification. Mecklenburg County and its mapping contractors assume no legal responsibility for the information contained herein.
Exhibit E
Hoyle House – Current Photos

Front
(South side)

West Side
Rear
(North side)
Exhibit F
Comparable Property Photos

Ashley Carol House

Front
(South side)

West Side
Consignment Shop

Front (East Side)

North Side
First Floor Photos

Dining room, 2nd room on west side

Foyer (view from rear house entry)

2nd room on east side

Original exterior window, now located in rear foyer area.
Exhibit H
Hoyle House Interior Photos

First Floor Photos

View from front entrance

Room to right of front entrance (SE corner)
Second Floor Photos

Master Suite
Second Floor Photos

Guest Bedroom 1

Guest Bedroom 2