

**Charlotte-Mecklenburg
HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION
May 8, 2017
Location: 2100 Randolph Road, Charlotte, N. C.
Time: 6:00 p.m. – 8:35 p.m.**

Draft Minutes

Present:

**Ms. Joy E. Bunch/Mayor
Mr. Larken Egleston/City/HLC Secretary/Survey Com. Chair
Mr. Joe Elliott/City/ HLC Treasurer
Ms. Penny Higdon/County
Ms. Laura Hoover/County
Mr. Mark H. Miller/County
Mr. Len Norman/City, HLC Chair
Mr. Jeffrey Parsons/Mayor
Mr. Kenneth Pursley/County, Design Review Com. Chair
Mr. Jonathan Schulz/City
Mr. John Shurley/County, HLC Vice-Chair/Projects Com. Chair
Dr. Dan L. Morrill, HLC Consulting Director
Mr. Stewart Gray, Senior Preservation Planner
Ms. Mary Lynn Morrill, HLC Recording Consultant
Mr. Sandy Carnegie (by telephone)
Mr. Peter Wasmer, Mecklenburg County AFM Department
Ms. Elizabeth Stuart, Administrative Assistant**

Absent:

Mr. Nathan Clark/County

Visitors:

**Joy Greer, Phillips Property
Don Naysmith, Phillips Property
Caroline Naysmith, Phillips Property
Mayor James Taylor, Phillips Property
John Urban, Phillips Property
Larry Lester, Phillips Property
S. Huff, Phillips Property
Paula Lester, Phillips Property
T. Cannon, Phillips Property
Brian Schoeck, Phillips Property
Leamon Brice, Mabonsie
Jake Armour, Sandifer House
John Carmichael, Wilson House and Farm**

**David Jarrett, Wilson House and Farm
Jay Rhodes, Mecklenburg County**

1. Consideration of Minutes

MR. SHURLEY PRESENTED A MOTION SECONDED BY MR. ELLIOTT THAT THE MINUTES FOR THE APRIL 10, 2017, MEETING OF THE HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION BE APPROVED. THE COMMISSION UNANIMOUSLY APPROVED THE MOTION.

MR. SHURLEY PRESENTED A MOTION SECONDED BY MS. HOOVER THAT THE MINUTES FOR THE APRIL 10, 2017, CLOSED SESSION MEETING OF THE HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION BE APPROVED. THE COMMISSION UNANIMOUSLY APPROVED THE MOTION.

2. Chair's Report: Mr. Len Norman

Mr. Norman asked the Commissioners to check their attendance and to make Ms. Stuart aware of any issues.

Mr. Norman stated that Ms. Bunch has submitted her letter of resignation from the Commission, effective July 1, 2017, because she is moving to Cary, N.C. Mr. Norman expressed the Commission's gratitude for her service and stated that she would be missed.

Mr. Norman reminded the Commissioners that the Historic Landmarks Commission does not meet in July.

The terms of Commissioners Pursley(County) and Shurley(County) will end in July. They are not eligible for reappointment and will be greatly missed. Commissioners Clark(County), and Norman(City) are eligible to renew their three year terms.

Mr. Norman stated that the Nominating Committee would be presenting a slate of officers later in the meeting and that elections of the officers would occur at the June meeting of the HLC.

3. Director's Report: Dr. Dan L. Morrill

a. Report of the Design Review Committee and the Projects Committee on the sale of the Phillips House and Morris Barn

Ms. Higdon requested that she be recused from the vote and discussion on the sale of the Phillips House and Morris Barn because of a potential conflict of interest.

MR. EGLESTON PRESENTED A MOTION SECONDED BY MR. SHURLEY THAT THE COMMISSION RECUSE MS. HIGDON FROM THE VOTE AND DISCUSSION

ON THE SALE OF THE PHILLIPS HOUSE AND MORRIS BARN DUE TO A POTENTIAL CONFLICT OF INTEREST. THE COMMISSION UNANIMOUSLY APPROVED THE MOTION.

Dr. Morrill reviewed the procedure that the Commission had approved for soliciting and evaluating proposals for the purchase of the Phillips House and Morris Barn, 131 West Charles St, Matthews, N.C. Dr. Morrill drew the Commission's attention to the criteria, which the Commission had approved for evaluating proposals.

MR. SHURLEY PRESENTED A MOTION SECONDED BY MR. MILLER THAT THE HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION AMEND THE MOTION APPROVED BY THE COMMISSION AT ITS MARCH 13, 2017 MEETING ESTABLISHING A TIMETABLE FOR EVALUATING PROPOSALS FOR THE PURCHASE OF THE PHILLIPS HOUSE AND MORRIS BARN AS FOLLOWS: 1) TO EXCLUDE THE OPPORTUNITY FOR PROSPECTIVE BUYERS TO AMEND THEIR PROPOSALS, AND 2) FOR THE COMMISSION TO HOLD ITS FINAL VOTE AT THE MAY 8, 2017 MEETING, NOT AT THE JUNE 12, 2017 MEETING AS PREVIOUSLY SCHEDULED. THE COMMISSION UNANIMOUSLY APPROVED THE MOTION.

The Historic Landmarks Commission conducted an extensive evaluation and discussion of the recommendation of the Design Review Committee and the Projects Committee. Mayor James Taylor and Mr. John Urban spoke on behalf of the proposal submitted jointly by the Town of Matthews and the Matthews Historical Foundation. Mr. Brian Schoeck spoke on behalf of the proposal submitted by Cardon Properties, LLC. A lengthy discussion ensued.

THE DESIGN REVIEW COMMITTEE AND THE PROJECTS COMMITTEE PRESENTED A SECONDED MOTION TO RECOMMEND TO THE HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION THAT IT RANK THE TOP TWO PROPOSALS FOR THE PURCHASE OF THE PHILLIPS HOUSE AND MORRIS BARN, 131 WEST CHARLES STREET, MATTHEWS, N.C., AS FOLLOWS: RANK ONE - PROPOSAL SUBMITTED BY CARDON PROPERTIES, LLC; RANK TWO - PROPOSAL SUBMITTED BY THE MATTHEWS HISTORICAL FOUNDATION AND THE TOWN OF MATTHEWS. THE COMMISSION APPROVED THE MOTION WITH THE FOLLOWING VOTE: OPPOSE - NORMAN, SCHULZ, PARSONS, EGGLESTON; FAVOR - HOOVER, ELLIOTT, BUNCH, MILLER, SHURLEY, PURSLEY.

Note: Ms. Higdon was recused from the vote.

MR. MILLER PRESENTED A MOTION SECONDED BY MR. PARSONS THAT THE HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION ENTER INTO A CONTRACT TO SELL THE PHILLIPS HOUSE AND MORRIS BARN, 131 WEST CHARLES ST, MATTHEWS, N.C., TO CARDON PROPERTIES, LLC IN ACCORDANCE WITH THE TERMS SET FORTH IN THE PROPOSAL SUBMITTED BY CARDON PROPERTIES, LLC. THE COMMISSION UNANIMOUSLY APPROVED THE MOTION.

Note: Ms. Higdon was recused from the vote.

Mr. Miller left the meeting at this point.

Dr. Morrill then reported the following information:

- 1) Edward Rozzel House, 11647 Old Rozzelles Ferry Road, Charlotte, N.C. Brian Jenest of Cole Jenest & Stone will be meeting with Staff to review a site plan for infill development. Upon the completion of this review, Staff will meet with Eric Gamble, who has the listing agent for the property, to prepare a marketing program for the property.**
- 2) Delburg Cotton Mill House, 303 Delburg Street, Davidson, N.C. The closing on the property has occurred, and the check has been deposited in the HLC's Revolving Fund.**
- 3) Torrence Lytle School, 302 Holbrooks Road, Huntersville, N.C. The environmental cleanup of the buildings is underway and should be completed this month. The prospective buyers of the property are continuing to perform due diligence. They have until mid-May to make a decision. The Projects Committee will have a recommendation regarding this property in the regular agenda.**
- 4) General Motors New Style Bus 1074. Staff is in contact with CATS to discuss arrangements for storing and servicing the bus.**
- 5) Phillips House and Morris Barn, 131 West Charles Street, Matthews, N.C. Three proposals have been presented for the purchase and development of the property. The Design Review Committee and the Projects Committee met jointly on April 26th to review the proposals and make a recommendation to the HLC.**
- 6) The James C. Dowd House, 2216 Monument Avenue, Charlotte, N.C. Staff has met with County Park and Recreation officials to discuss possible methods for best assuring the long-term preservation of the property. Negotiations continue.**
- 7) William Grier House. Douglas International Airport owns this house. Staff has met with Airport officials and will consider preservation strategies if the property is deemed eligible for listing in the National Register of Historic Places. There have been no developments since the last meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission.**
- 8) Thrift Piedmont and Northern Depot. The North Carolina Department of Transportation has moved the depot to land purchased by NCDOT. The State continues to refurbish the building and to seek a tenant.**
- 9) There has been no contact from the County about the need for changes to the State Enabling Legislation to allow the Commission to meet in closed session when discussing the sale of property. Staff awaits developments.**
- 10) Siloam Rosenwald School, John Adams Road, Charlotte, N.C. Staff continues to work with the Charlotte Museum of History to develop a preservation strategy for the**

property. Staff is awaiting receipt of a budget to move the structure to the grounds of the Charlotte Museum of History.

11) Streetcar 85. The Streetcar was moved on March 9, 2016, to the North Carolina Transportation Museum in Spencer, N.C. The Commission will be responsible for securing a generator and a cart to power the Streetcar. Staff has contacted the Museum about the status of the streetcar. Staff anticipates that the Museum will need the generator and the cart in the near future.

12) Consideration of the Prospective Purchase of the VanLandingham Estate, 2010 The Plaza, Charlotte, N.C. Staff met with the owner and Brian Jenest to discuss preservation strategies for the property. The property is no longer under contract. Brian Jenest will be contacting parties associated with the infill development that was rejected by City Council in 2015 to see if it might be revived without including a swimming pool. Staff will keep the Commission advised.

13) Morgan School. Staff has talked with Pamela Wideman of the City. The City has obtained an appraisal of the market value of the property. The City's involvement in preserving the building will largely rest upon the decision of the Cherry neighborhood as to whether it wants the building to continue as a school or be used for affordable housing. Staff has been unsuccessful in obtaining further updates.

14) Consideration of the Prospective Purchase of the Charles Barnhardt House, 2733 Country Club Lane, Charlotte, N.C. The owner has advised Staff that the recording of the plat has been delayed until mid-summer. The vote of City Council on historic landmark designation will not occur until September. Staff will begin preparing marketing materials for the house.

15) Staff continues to anticipate using real estate options as a preservation tool.

16) Excelsior Club, 921 Beatties Ford Road, Charlotte, N.C. Staff has obtained an appraisal of the property. Staff will initiate discussions with County officials about next steps. The appraised value of the property is \$228,000.

17) American Legion Memorial Stadium. Staff will be meeting on May 18th with potential developers of a major league soccer stadium on the property. The purpose will be to discuss the HLC's design review process.

4. Public Hearing on the Prospective Listing of the Highland Mill No. 1, 340 East 16th St, Charlotte, N.C., in the National Register of Historic Places

MR. EGLESTON PRESENTED A MOTION SECONDED BY MR. PURSLEY THAT THE HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION OPEN A PUBLIC HEARING TO CONSIDER THE PROSPECTIVE LISTING OF THE HIGHLAND MILL NO. 1, 340 EAST 16TH ST, CHARLOTTE, N.C., IN THE NATIONAL REGISTER OF HISTORIC PLACES. THE COMMISSION UNANIMOUSLY APPROVED THE MOTION.

Nobody from the public appeared to speak on the issue.

Mr. Gray reviewed the historic significance of the Highland Mill No. 1. Staff stated its judgment that the Highland Mill No. 1 does meet the criteria for listing in the National Register of Historic Places.

MR. EGLESTON PRESENTED A MOTION SECONDED BY MR. PARSONS THAT THE HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION STATE THAT IT JUDGES THAT THE HIGHLAND MILL NO. 1, 340 EAST 16TH ST, CHARLOTTE, N.C., SATISFIES THE CRITERIA FOR LISTING IN THE NATIONAL REGISTER OF HISTORIC PLACES AND THAT THE COMMISSION CLOSE THE PUBLIC HEARING. THE COMMISSION UNANIMOUSLY APPROVED THE MOTION.

5. Design Review Committee Report: Mr. Ken Pursley

1) Consideration of an Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the Demolition of the Wilson House and Farm, 11400 Old Statesville Rd, Huntersville, N.C.

Staff will investigate potential penalties for the demolition of historic landmarks without having received a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Ms. Higdon requested that she be recused from the vote and discussion on the Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the Wilson House and Farm because of a potential conflict of interest.

MR. SHURLEY PRESENTED A MOTION SECONDED BY MR. PURSLEY THAT THE COMMISSION RECUSE MS. HIGDON FROM THE VOTE AND DISCUSSION ON THE APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS FOR THE DEMOLITION OF THE WILSON HOUSE AND FARM, 11400 OLD STATESVILLE RD, HUNTERSVILLE, N.C. DUE TO A POTENTIAL CONFLICT OF INTEREST. THE COMMISSION UNANIMOUSLY APPROVED THE MOTION.

THE DESIGN REVIEW COMMITTEE PRESENTED A SECONDED MOTION TO RECOMMEND TO THE HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION TO DELAY THE EFFECTIVE DATE OF THE CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS FOR THE DEMOLITION OF THE WILSON HOUSE AND FARM, 11400 OLD STATESVILLE RD, HUNTERSVILLE, N.C., FOR 180 DAYS FROM THE DATE OF ISSUANCE. THE COMMISSION DISAPPROVED THE MOTION WITH THE FOLLOWING VOTE: FAVOR - ELLIOTT, NORMAN; OPPOSE - BUNCH, EGLESTON, HOOVER, PARSONS, PURSLEY, SCHULZ, SHURLEY.

Note: Ms. Higdon was recused from the vote.

MR. SHURLEY PRESENTED A MOTION SECONDED BY MR. PURSLEY THAT THE EFFECTIVE DATE OF THE CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS FOR THE DEMOLITION OF THE WILSON HOUSE AND FARM, 11400 OLD STATESVILLE RD, HUNTERSVILLE, N.C., BE DELAYED 365 DAYS FROM THE DATE OF

ISSUANCE. THE COMMISSION APPROVED THE MOTION WITH MR. NORMAN VOTING IN OPPOSITION.

Note: Ms. Higdon was recused from the vote.

2) Consideration of an Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for material alterations to Mabonsie, 312 S. Thompson St, Davidson, N.C.

The applicant is proposing to:

- A. Add a dormer to the rear of the house**
- B. Rebuild and extend a carport on the south elevation.**

THE DESIGN REVIEW COMMITTEE PRESENTED A SECONDED MOTION TO RECOMMEND TO THE HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION THAT IT APPROVE THE ISSUANCE OF A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS AS PRESENTED FOR MATERIAL ALTERATIONS OF MABONSIE, 312 S. THOMPSON ST, DAVIDSON, N.C. THE COMMISSION UNANIMOUSLY APPROVED THE MOTION.

3) Consideration of an Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for material alterations to the Thomas T. Sandifer House, 12601 Moore's Chapel Rd, Charlotte, N.C.

The applicant is proposing to:

- A. Remodel the existing kitchen**
- B. Convert a window opening on the rear of the house into a cased opening**
- C. Build a mudroom over an existing non-original rear stoop, and add a new brick stoop and stairs adjacent to the mudroom.**

THE DESIGN REVIEW COMMITTEE PRESENTED A SECONDED MOTION TO RECOMMEND TO THE HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION THAT IT APPROVE THE ISSUANCE OF A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS FOR THE THOMAS T. SANDIFER HOUSE, 12601 MOORE'S CHAPEL ROAD, CHARLOTTE, N.C., WITH THE STIPULATION THAT THE APPLICANT SHALL SUPPLY TO THE HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION ILLUSTRATIONS AND DESCRIPTIONS OF THE PHYSICAL CHANGES TO THE STRUCTURE. THE COMMISSION UNANIMOUSLY APPROVED THE MOTION.

6. Survey Committee Report: Mr. Larken Egleston

a) Consideration of the Survey and Research Report on the Parkwood Avenue Associate Reformed Presbyterian Church, 1017 Parkwood Ave, Charlotte, N.C.

Dr. Morrill and Mr. Gray reviewed the historic and architectural significance of the Parkwood Avenue Associate Reformed Presbyterian Church as described in the Survey and Research Report. Staff stated that it judged that the subject property does meet the statutory requirements for special significance required for historic landmarks.

MR. EGLESTON PRESENTED A MOTION SECONDED BY MR. PARSONS THAT THE HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION RECOMMEND THAT THE CHARLOTTE CITY COUNCIL DESIGNATE THE PARKWOOD AVENUE ASSOCIATE REFORMED PRESBYTERIAN CHURCH (INTERIOR OF THE BUILDING, EXTERIOR OF THE BUILDING, AND ALL LAND ASSOCIATED THEREWITH), 1017 PARKWOOD AVE, CHARLOTTE, N.C., AS A LOCAL HISTORIC LANDMARK AS DEFINED IN N.C.G.S.160A-400. THE COMMISSION UNANIMOUSLY APPROVED THE MOTION.

MR. EGLESTON PRESENTED A MOTION SECONDED BY MR. SCHULZ THAT THE HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION IMPOSE A DELAY OF DEMOLITION OF THE PARKWOOD AVENUE ASSOCIATE REFORMED PRESBYTERIAN CHURCH, 1017 PARKWOOD AVE, CHARLOTTE, N.C., FOR 180 DAYS FROM TODAY OR UNTIL SUCH TIME AS THE CITY COUNCIL TAKES ACTION ON THE COMMISSION'S RECOMMENDATION FOR DESIGNATION, WHICHEVER OCCURS FIRST. THE COMMISSION UNANIMOUSLY APPROVED THE MOTION.

7. Treasurer's Report: Mr. Joe Elliott

Mr. Elliott distributed and presented the May 2017 Treasurer's Report.

8. Projects Committee Report: Mr. John Shurley

THE PROJECTS COMMITTEE PRESENTED A SECONDED MOTION TO RECOMMEND TO THE HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION THAT IT APPROVE THE EXPENDITURE OF UP TO \$188,500 TO REPAIR THE ROOFS OF BUILDINGS A. B. AND C. AT THE TORRENCE LYTTLE SCHOOL, 302 HOLBROOKS ROAD, HUNTERSVILLE, N.C.

Ms. Wasmer stated that he needed to have a consultant investigate the buildings before a final decision should be made about the repair of the roofs.

MR. SHURLEY PRESENTED A MOTION SECONDED BY MR. PARSONS THAT THE MOTION BE TABLED UNTIL THE JUNE MEETING OF THE HLC. THE COMMISSION UNANIMOUSLY APPROVED THE MOTION.

9. Nominating Committee Report: Mr. Ken Pursley

Mr. Pursley thanked the members of the Nominating Committee (Mr. Egleston and Mr. Elliott) for their service and presented the following slate of officers for the Commission's vote at the June meeting of the HLC - Chair: Mr. Norman; Vice Chair: Mr. Egleston; Secretary: Mr. Parsons; Treasurer: Mr. Clark. Dr. Morrill stated that nominations could be made from the floor at the June HLC meeting.

Mr. Norman reported that the following individuals would serve as chairs of committees - Design Review Committee: Mr. Elliott; Nominating Committee: Ms. Hoover; Survey Committee: Mr. Parsons; Projects Committee: Mr. Miller.

10. Old Business:

There was no old Business.

11. New Business:

There was no new business.

The meeting adjourned at 8:35 p.m.